Discussion of: CDD and Social Capital-
Lab-in-the-Field Evidence from Sudan

Cathérine Désirée Gamper, Economist at the OECD
(Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development)
Presentation Overview

• Brief Summary of Program, and IE (Sampling and Identification Strategy, Results)

• Discussion:
  • Literature
  • CDF program and causality mechanisms
  • Sampling Strategy
  • Methodology (Estimator Choice, Rationale)

• Conclusions (Recommendations for Future CDD Experiments)
CDF Program Overview:

• Implemented from 2006 onwards
• 30 Mil. USD
• 4 states in Sudan affected by conflict
• Implemented in: 28 localities, 616 communities (out of 2813)
• How?
  • Localities decided on use of CDF funds
  • Designed for public infrastructure needs
  • Targeted poor areas
  • Included capacity building component
Impact Evaluation Overview:

- Experiments complemented by HH survey:
  - Sample: 6 neediest villages in each of 10 representative localities
  - 4 treatment and 2 control
  - 23 households in each of 24 communities
  - Of 576 Households 475 sent to games
Findings of 5 Games:

• (Control) Game 1: Risk Attitude
  • (People more risk taking appear more trusting, but gamble with community)
  • Results: good variation, no risk of biasing results

• (Control) Game 2: Discount Rates
  • 202 (out of how many?) chose to take money in a weeks time
Findings of 5 Games:

- **Game 3: Altruism**
  - Dictator game
  - Half of the amount was sent to needy family

- **Game 4: Trust and Trust Worthiness**
  - Average amount returned from
    - Sender to receiver: half
    - Receiver to sender: one third

- **Game 5: Collective good Contribution**
  - \(\frac{3}{4}\) contributed to collective good

Average pay-out of all games: 15 Sudanese Pounds (equivalent of one day’s wage)
Brief Summary of IE and Results (Sample, Identification Strategy, Results)

Findings of 5 Games:

NO IMPACT OF PROGRAM ON INDIVIDUAL LEVELS OF SOCIAL CAPITAL
Discussion of Game Results

• Method: Why ATT?
• Even if no program impact, what do the results tell you?
• Were you able to check to what extent the participants were exposed (or implicated in) the CDF
Summary of Survey Findings

• **NO significant differences in results with regard to:**
  • Voting
  • Participation in associations
  • Contacting elected representatives
  • Discuss community problems with others
  • Contacted police
  • Donated or in-kind services to community
  • Volunteer in charitable organizations

• **SIGNIFICANT differences in:**
  • Contacting influential person (ATT: 6%, Control: 6%)
  • Making Media Aware of a Problem (ATT:7%, Control: 3%)
Main Result:

Currently no difference between treated and control, but improved over the last year in the treatment group

Why? Maybe not randomly selected? Treatment initially weaker “social capital”?
Discussion: Literature

• Mixed Results in Literature
  • Labonne and Chase
  • Olken and Bnerjee
  • Bjorkman and Svensson
Discussion: CDF program and causality mechanisms

• Mixed results in the literature – why?
  • Inference: failure in social capital, failure to improve local institutions
  • Fundamental question: how does this program impact on the two?
    • Community contributions?
    • Community participation other than VDC?
  • Maybe IE’s after 5 years can only look at how well CDD did to impact on trajectory results? (such as are decisions taken more democratically, community infrastructure better maintained etc)
Discussion: sampling strategy and methodology

• Why is unit of observation HH and not individual?
• Who participated in the games and in the survey?
• survey only once?
• How were the samples stratified for CDF and for IE (maybe not random?)
• if non-random, why not RDD considered?
• pre and post intervention experiments?
• interpretation of results with regard to actual CDF intervention in community?
Conclusions

• **Recommendations for Future Experiments:**
  • Experience in Sudan compared to Burkina and Cambodia?
  • Usefulness of Experiments in informing CDD?
  • Caveats in using them more widely? Difficulties with participants if illiterate?
  • How does your experiment inform future CDD design?
Thank you!

Catherine.Gamper@oecd.org